BEFORE THE ARIZONA STATE BOARD OF APPRAISAL

2

3

4

1

IN THE MATTER OF:

MICHAEL F. CECCHI Certified Residential Appraiser Certificate No. 20897

CASE Nos. 3088, 3089 and 3090

CONSENT AGREEMENT AND ORDER OF DISCIPLINE

6

8

10

11

In the interest of a prompt and judicious settlement of the above-captioned matters before the Arizona Board of Appraisal ("Board") and consistent with public interest, statutory requirements and responsibilities of the Board, and pursuant to A.R.S.§ 32-3601 et seg. and A.R.S. §41-1092.07(F)(5), Michael F. Cecchi ("Respondent"), holder of Certificate No. 20897 and the Board enter into this Consent Agreement, Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Order ("Consent Agreement") as the final disposition of this matter.

On June 20, 2010, the Board met to discuss case nos. 3088, 3089 and 3090. Respondent appeared personally and on his own behalf. At the conclusion of the Board's consideration of these matters, the Board voted to offer the Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Discipline in lieu of further administrative proceedings.

JURISDICTION

- The Arizona State Board of Appraisal ("Board") is the state agency 1. authorized pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-3601 et seq., and the rules promulgated thereunder, found in the Arizona Administrative Code ("A.A.C." or "rules") at R4-46-101 et seq., to regulate and control the licensing and certification of real property appraisers in the State of Arizona.
- Respondent holds a certificate as a Certified Residential Appraiser in the 2. State of Arizona, Certificate No. 20897 issued on January 29, 1999, pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-3612.

5

12 13

14

15

16 17

18

19 20

21

22

23 24

25

CONSENT AGREEMENT

Respondent understands and agrees that:

- 1. The Board has jurisdiction over Respondent and the subject matter pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-3601 *et seq.*
- 2. Respondent has the right to consult with an attorney prior to entering into this Consent Agreement.
- 3. Respondent has a right to a public hearing concerning this case. He further acknowledges that at such formal hearing he could present evidence and cross-examine witnesses. Respondent irrevocably waives his right to such a hearing.
- 4. Respondent irrevocably waives any right to rehearing or review or to any judicial review or any other appeal of this matter.
- 5. This Consent Agreement shall be subject to the approval of the Board and shall be effective only when signed by the Executive Director and accepted by the Board. In the event that the Board does not approve this Consent Agreement, it is withdrawn and shall be of no evidentiary value and shall not be relied upon nor introduced in any action by any party, except that the parties agree that should the Board reject this Consent Agreement and this case proceeds to hearing, Respondent shall assert no claim that the Board was prejudiced by its review and discussion of this document or any records relating thereto.
- 6. The Consent Agreement, once approved by the Board and signed by the Respondent, shall constitute a public record which may be disseminated as a formal action of the Board.

FINDINGS OF FACT

On or about June 20, 2010, the Board's investigation revealed the following:

- 1. This matter deals with an appraisal conducted and report written by Respondent of a property located at 4228 E. Camino De La Colina, Tucson, AZ 85711.
- 2. The Comparable Sales used by Respondent within the appraisal report were not the best sales available at the time of the inspection. The Respondent failed to use numerous comparables with current close of escrow dates, similar properties bracketed for the subject's age, square footage, bedroom and bathroom count, lot size and amenities. The Respondent also failed to provide an explanation for the lack of using the more similar comparables which resulted in a value conclusion that was not supported by current market data.
- 3. In the Sales Comparison Approach, the Respondent failed to correctly report, if any, sales concessions for the comparables selected. Use of the term "N/A" is not an acceptable term to accurately describe sales concessions and fails to meet FHA requirements. If no concessions exist, the Respondent must note "None" in the Sales or Financing Concession field of the report.
- 4. In addition, on top of page 2 of 6, Sales Comparison Approach section of the report, the Respondent provided data for "comparable properties currently offered for sale." This data is inconsistent with information provided within the 1004MC.
- 5. With respect to the Additional Comparable page, the Respondent failed to make appropriate time adjustments based on the subject's declining market conditions for comparable no. 4.
- 6. Moreover, the appraisal report did not include a minimum of two active listings or pending sales on the appraisal grid of the applicable appraisal reporting form. In addition, the Respondent failed to complete the "Median Sales Prices as % of list Price" within the 1004MC as it was left blank. Similarly, the Respondent failed to clearly identify the Overall Trend for the Median Comparable List Price, within the Market

Research Analysis section of the 1004MC form. The Respondent incorrectly indicated both "Increasing and Declining" as the overall trend.

- 7. On page 1 of 6 in the Improvements Section of the appraisal report, the Respondent indicated that the subject has central air conditioning but this is contradictory to what the Respondent noted on page 2 where he indicated "No A/C."
- 8. Finally, the workfile contained no land data or extraction notes and the zoning was incorrectly noted.

<u> 3089</u>

On or about June 20, 2010, the Board's investigation revealed the following:

- 1. This matter deals with an appraisal conducted and report written by Respondent of a property located at 201 N. Melanie Lane, Tucson, AZ 85710.
- 2. While Respondent was unable to obtain a copy of the sales contract, he should have disclosed in the report the efforts he undertook to obtain the sales contract.
- 3. With respect to the Sales Comparison Approach, the Respondent failed to make appropriate time adjustments based on the subject declining market conditions for the comparables used.
- 4. The Respondent made an inconsistent adjustment for the fireplace in comparable no. 2 because the subject has a similar fireplace as comparable no. 2 so no adjustment was warranted.
- 5. With respect to comparable no. 8, the Respondent used a photograph from the MLS but did not include his own additional photos of the comparable to show the condition at the time of inspection.
- 6. In the Sales Comparison Approach, the Respondent failed to correctly report, if any, sales concessions for the comparables selected. Use of the term "N/A" is not an acceptable term to accurately describe sales concessions and fails to meet FHA

requirements. If no concessions exist, the Respondent must note "None" in the Sales or 1 Financing Concession field of the report. 3 3090 On or about June 20, 2010, the Board's investigation revealed the following: 5 7. This matter deals with an appraisal conducted and report written by Respondent of a property located at 201 N. Melanic Lanc, Tucson, AZ 85710. 7 8. With respect to the Sales Comparison Approach, the Respondent failed to make appropriate time adjustments based on the subject declining market conditions for the comparables used. 9. On page 1 of 6, the Respondent noted that the subject was both "owner 10 occupied" and "vacant". This statement is misleading and fails to provide clear and 11 accurate information to the reader. 12 13 10. Moreover, the Respondent failed to complete the "Median Sales Prices as % of list Price" within the 1004MC as it was left blank and HUD was not listed as the 14 intended user. The workfile also did not contain in land data. 15 16 11. The Respondent indicated that the subject was vacant at the time of inspection and failed to indicate whether the utilities were on or off at the time and 17 working appropriately. 18 19 In the Sales Comparison Approach, the Respondent failed to correctly 12. report, if any, sales concessions for the comparables selected. Use of the term "N/A" is 20 21 not an acceptable term to accurately describe sales concessions and fails to meet FHA requirements. If no concessions exist, the Respondent must note "None" in the Sales or 22 23 Financing Concession field of the report. 24 1/// 25 III26 1///

1. 2. Acceptability 3.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. Pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-3635, a certified or licensed appraiser in the State of Arizona must comply with the standards of practice adopted by the Board. The Standards of Practice adopted by the Board are codified in the USPAP edition applicable at the time of the appraisal.

The conduct described above constitutes violations of the following provisions of the USPAP, 2008-2009 edition:

Standards Rule 1-2(h) and Scope of Work---Acceptability

<u>3089</u>

2. Pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-3635, a certified or licensed appraiser in the State of Arizona must comply with the standards of practice adopted by the Board. The Standards of Practice adopted by the Board are codified in the USPAP edition applicable at the time of the appraisal.

The conduct described above constitutes violations of the following provisions of the USPAP, 2008-2009 edition:

Standards Rule 1-2(h); Standards Rule 1-5(a) and Scope of Work Rule---Acceptability

3. Pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-3635, a certified or licensed appraiser in the State of Arizona must comply with the standards of practice adopted by the Board. The Standards of Practice adopted by the Board are codified in the USPAP edition applicable at the time of the appraisal.

The conduct described above constitutes violations of the following provisions of the USPAP, 2008-2009 edition:

Standards Rule 1-2(h) and Scope of Work Rule---Acceptability.

ORDER

Based upon the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, the parties agree to the following:

- 1. Upon the effective date of this Consent Agreement, Respondent's Certificate as a Certified Residential Appraiser shall be placed on probation for a minimum period of six (6) months. During probation, Respondent shall (a) demonstrate resolution of the problems that resulted in this disciplinary actions; (b) comply with the terms of this Consent Agreement and Order and (c) comply with USPAP, Arizona Revised Statutes and Appraisal Board rules. The effective date of this Consent Agreement is the date that it is signed by the Board's Executive Director on behalf of the Board.
- 2. Respondent shall successfully complete the following education within six (6) months of the effective date of this Consent Agreement: Seven (7) hours of Sales Comparison Approach; seven (7) hours of Scope of Work; fifteen (15) hours of Basic Appraisal (to include Market Trends and an exam) and seven (7) hours of USPAP Update for the 2010-2011 edition. The education under this paragraph may not be counted toward the continuing education requirements for the renewal of Respondent's certificate however, the seven (7) hour USPAP update course may be counted toward the continuing education requirements for the renewal of Respondent's certificate. The same class may not be repeated to fulfill the education requirements of this Consent Agreement
- 3. Proof of completion of the required education must be submitted to the Board within 3 weeks of completion of the required courses. Respondent shall bear all costs and expenses associated with completing the education required in paragraph 2.
- 4. During the period of probation, Respondent shall complete a minimum of twelve (12) appraisal reports. The Board reserves the right to audit any of Respondent's

reports and conduct peer review, as deemed necessary, during the probationary period. The Board may, in its discretion, seek separate disciplinary action against the Respondent for any violation of the applicable statutes and rules discovered in an audit of the Respondent's appraisal reports provided to the Board under the terms of this Consent Agreement.

- 5. The Respondent shall file an appraisal log with the Board on a monthly basis listing every Arizona appraisal that he has completed within the prior calendar month by property address, appraisal type, valuation date, the date the appraisal was issued, and the number of hours worked on each assignment. The report log shall be filed monthly beginning the 15th day of the first month following the start of Respondent's probationary period and continuing each month thereafter until the Board terminates the probation. If the log reporting date falls on a Saturday, Sunday, or holiday, the report log is due on the next business day. Even if Respondent performs no appraisals within a given month, he must still file an appraisal log with the Board showing that no appraisals were performed. The monthly log report may be filed by mail or facsimile.
- 6. Respondent's probation shall continue until: (a) Respondent petitions the Board for termination as provided in paragraph 7, and (b) the Board terminates the probation. Upon petition by the Respondent for termination of the probation, the Board will select and audit 3 of Respondent's appraisal reports.
- At the end of six (6) months from the effective date of this Consent Agreement, the Respondent may petition the Board for termination of his probation. If the Board determines that Respondent has not complied with all the requirements of this Consent Agreement, the Board, at its sole discretion, may either: (a) continue the probation or (b) institute proceedings for noncompliance with this Consent Agreement, which may result in suspension, revocation, or other disciplinary and/or remedial action.

8. Respondent shall not act as a supervising appraiser for other appraisers or trainees, nor shall he act as a mentor, during the term of the probation. Respondent shall also not teach any course related to real estate appraisals during the term of the probation.

- 9. Respondent shall comply with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice in performing all appraisals and all Board statutes and rules.
- 10. If, between the effective date of this Consent Agreement and the termination of Respondent's probation by the Board, Respondent fails to renew his license while under this Consent Agreement and subsequently applies for a license or certificate, the remaining terms of this Consent Agreement, including probation and mentorship, shall be imposed if the application for license or certificate is granted.
- 11. Respondent has read and understands this Consent Agreement as set forth herein, and has had the opportunity to discuss this Consent Agreement with an attorney or has waived the opportunity to discuss this Consent Agreement with an attorney. Respondent voluntarily enters into this Consent Agreement for the purpose of avoiding the expense and uncertainty of an administrative hearing.
- 12. Respondent understands that he has a right to a public administrative hearing concerning each and every allegation set forth in the above-captioned matter, at which administrative hearing he could present evidence and cross-examine witnesses. By entering into this Consent Agreement, Respondent freely and voluntarily relinquishes all rights to such an administrative hearing, as well as all rights of rehearing, review, reconsideration, appeal, judicial review or any other administrative and/or judicial action, concerning the matters set forth herein. Respondent affirmatively agrees that this Consent Agreement shall be irrevocable.
- 13. Respondent understands that this Consent Agreement, or any part thereof, may be considered in any future disciplinary action against him.

- 15. Time is of the essence with regard to this agreement.
- 16. If Respondent fails to comply with the terms of this Consent Agreement, the Board shall properly institute proceedings for noncompliance with this Consent Agreement, which may result in suspension, revocation, or other disciplinary and/or remedial actions. Respondent agrees that any violation of this Consent Agreement is a violation of A.R.S. § 32-3631(A)(8), which is willfully disregarding or violating any of the provisions of the Board's statutes or the rules of the Board for the administration and enforcement of its statutes.
- dismissal or resolution of other matters currently pending before the Board, if any, and does not constitute any waiver, express or implied, of the Board's statutory authority or jurisdiction regard any other pending or future investigation, action or proceeding. Respondent also understands that acceptance of this Consent Agreement does not preclude any other agency, subdivision or officer of this state from instituting other civil or criminal proceedings with respect to the conduct that is the subject of this Consent Agreement.
- 18. Respondent understands that the foregoing Consent Agreement shall not become effective unless and until adopted by the Board of Appraisal and executed on behalf of the Board. Any modification to this original document is ineffective and void unless mutually approved by the parties in writing.
- 19. Respondent understands that this Consent Agreement is a public record that may be publicly disseminated as a formal action of the Board.

26 || / / /

///

1	20. Pursuant to the Board's Substantive Policy Statement #1, the Board	1
2	considers the violations in the above-referenced matters to constitute to a Level III	
3	Violation.	
4	DATED this day of November, 2010.	
5	/7	
6	Caril Futnosel	
/ 7	Michael F. Cecchi Respondent Daniel Pietropaulo Executive Director	
8	Arizona Board of Appraisal	
9		
10	ORIGINAL of the foregoing filed	
11	this 2 day of November, 2010 with:	
12	Arizona Board of Appraisal 1400 West Washington Street, Suite 360	
13	Phoenix, Arizona 85007	
14	and certified mail 7009 1680 0000 7387 7049 this 2 day of November, 2010 to:	
15	Mr. Michael F. Cecchi	
16	5343 W. Tortolita Flats Lane Marana, AZ 85658	
17	COPY of the foregoing sent or delivered	
18	this 2 day of November, 2010 to:	
19	Jeanne M. Galvin Assistant Attorney General	
20	Arizona Attorney General's Office 1275 West Washington, CIV/LES	
21	Phoenix, Arizona 85007	
22		
23	By:	
24)	(x 070) 7	
25	Rebecca M. Lour	
		l